COMP/CS 605: Introduction to Parallel Computing Lecture : Shared Memory Programming using PThreads

Mary Thomas

Department of Computer Science Computational Science Research Center (CSRC) San Diego State University (SDSU)

> Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17

2/40 Mary Thomas

Table of Contents

PThreads

2 Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

- Shared Memory Systems
- Threads and Processes
- Basic Pthreads Program: Hello World
- POSIX Threads API
- Matrix-Vector Multiplication with Pthreads
- Optimization Period Synchronization
 - Critical Sections

COMP/CS 605:	Lecture	Presented: 04/04/17	Updated: 04/03/17	3/40	Mary Thomas
PThreads					

Introduction to Shared Memory Programming using PThreads.

COMP/CS 605:	Lecture	Presented: 04/04/17	Updated: 04/03/17	4/40	Mary Thomas
Shared Memo	ry Programming	with PThreads			
Shared Mer	nory Systems				

Shared Memory System

Best candidates:

- can be organized into discrete, independent tasks which can execute concurrently
- routines can be interchanged, interleaved and/or overlapped in real time



COMP/CS 605:	Lecture	Presented: 04/04/17	Updated: 04/03/17	5/40	Mary Thomas
Shared Memo	ry Programming	with PThreads			
Threads an	d Processes				

Shared Memory System





- A process is an instance of a running (or suspended) program.
- Can be "muti-threaded," created by OS, requires a fair amount of "overhead"
- Process ID, process group ID, user ID, and group ID, Environment
- program instructions, registers, stack, heap, signals, libraries
- working directory, file descriptors
- Inter-process communication tools (such as message queues, pipes, semaphores, or shared memory).



- Threads are analogous to a light-weight process.
- Shared memory program: single process may have multiple threads of control.
- Independent stream of instructions, run inside processes
- Programs/procedures: runs independently from main program (e.g. multiple functions running concurrently)
- Example: main program (a.out) that contains a number of procedures that can be scheduled to run simultaneously and/or independently
- Thread models:
 - Manager/worker: a single thread, manager assigns work to other threads (workers).
 - Pipeline: task is broken into series of subops; each handled in series, but concurrently by another thread.
 - Peer: After the main thread (manager) creates other threads, it participates in the work.

Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

Threads and Processes





- Portable Operating System Interface
- IEEE's POSIX Threads Model (Pthreads):
 - programming models for threads in a UNIX platform
 - Pthreads are included in the international standards ISO/IEC9945-1
- A standard for Unix-like operating systems.
- A library that can be linked with C programs.
- Specifies an application programming interface (API) for multi-threaded programming.

The Pthreads API is only available on POSIXR systems such as: Linux, MacOS X, Solaris, HPUX,

COMP/CS 605: Lecture

Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17

10/40

Mary Thomas

Shared Memory Programming with PThreads Basic Pthreads Program: Hello World

Phreads: Hello World

```
[frame=single,rulecolor=\color{blue}]
/* File: pth_hello.c
 * Purpose:
 *
     Illustrate basic use of pthreads: create some threads,
 *
     each of which prints a message.
 * Input: none
 * Output: message from each thread
 * Compile: gcc -g -Wall -o pth hello pth hello.c -lpthread
 * Usage: ./pth hello <thread count>
* IPP: Section 4.2 (p. 153 and ff.)
 */
#include <stdio.h>
#include <stdlib h>
#include <pthread.h>
const int MAX THDS = 64:
/* Global variable: accessible to all threads */
int thread count:
void Usage(char* prog_name);
void *Hello(void* rank); /* Thread function */
/*----*/
int main(int argc, char* argv[]) {
  /* Use long in case of a 64-bit system */
  long
             thread:
  pthread_t* thread_handles;
  /* Get number of threads from command line */
  if (argc != 2) Usage(argv[0]);
  thread_count = strtol(argv[1], NULL, 10);
  if (thread_count<= 0 || thread_count>MAX_THDS)
          Usage(argv[0]);
```

```
thread_handles = malloc (thread_count*sizeof(pthread_t))
  for (thread = 0; thread < thread_count; thread++)</pre>
     pthread_create(&thread_handles[thread], NULL,
         Hello, (void*) thread):
  printf("Hello from the main thread\n"):
  for (thread = 0: thread < thread count: thread++)</pre>
     pthread join(thread handles[thread]. NULL);
  free(thread handles):
  return 0:
} /* main */
/*-----*/
void *Hello(void* rank) {
  /* Use long in case of a 64-bit system */
  long my rank = (long) rank:
  printf("Hello from thread %ld of %d\n".
          my rank. thread count):
  return NULL;
} /* Hello */
/*----*/
void Usage(char* prog_name) {
  fprintf(stderr, "usage: %s <number of threads>\n", prog_name)
  fprintf(stderr, "0 < number of threads <= %d\n", MAX_THREADS)
  exit(0):
} /* Usage */
```

COMP/CS 605: Lecture Presented: 04/04/17 Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17

11/40 Mary Thomas

nared Memory Programming with PThrea Basic Pthreads Program: Hello World

Compiling and running a Pthreads program

- Pthreads is a standard C library
- Compile like standard C code:

[gidget] % gcc -g -Wall -o pth_hello pth_hello.c -lpthread

```
[gidget] % ./pth_hello 1
Hello from the main thread
Hello from thread 0 of 1
[gidget:dev/ipp.ch4/hello] mthomas% ./pth_hello 4
Hello from thread 0 of 4
Hello from thread 2 of 4
Hello from thread 1 of 4
Hello from the main thread
Hello from thread 3 of 4
```

COMP/CS 605: Lecture Presented: 04/04/ Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17

12/40 N

Mary Thomas

hared Memory Programming with PThread Basic Pthreads Program: Hello World

Running a Pthreads program on tuckoo

[mthomas@tuckoo ch4] gcc -g -Wall -o pth_hello pth_hello.c -lpthread

[mthomas@tuckoo ch4] ./pth_hello 8

Hello from thread 0 of 8 Hello from thread 1 of 8 Hello from thread 2 of 8 Hello from thread 3 of 8 Hello from thread 4 of 8 Hello from thread 5 of 8 Hello from thread 6 of 8 Hello from the main thread Hello from thread 7 of 8

13/40 Mary Thomas

Shared Memory Programming with PThreads Basic Pthreads Program: Hello World

Warning about global variables

- All threads have access to the same global, shared memory
- Threads also have their own private data
- Limit use of global variables to situations where they are really needed:
 - Shared variables.
- Programmers are responsible for synchronizing access (protecting) globally shared data.
 - Can introduce subtle and confusing bugs

Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

COMP/CS 605: Lecture POSIX Threads API

POSIX Threads API: Four Main Groups

- Thread management: Routines that work directly on threads creating, detaching, joining, etc.
- Mutexes: Routines that deal with synchronization, called a "mutex", which is an abbreviation for "mutual exclusion".
- Condition variables: Routines that address communications between threads that share a mutex. Includes functions to create, destroy, wait and signal based upon specified variable values.
- Synchronization: Routines that manage read/write locks and barriers.



- Processes in MPI are usually started by a script.
- In Pthreads the threads are started by the program executable.



```
int pthread_create (
    pthread_t* thread_p /*out*/,
    const pthread_attr_t* attr_p /*in*/,
    void* (*start_routine ) (void ) /*in*/,
    void* arg_p //*in*/, );
```



pthread_t objects

- Opaque
- The actual data that they store is systemspecific.
- Their data members aren't directly accessible to user code.
- However, the Pthreads standard guarantees that a pthread_t object does store enough information to uniquely identify the thread with which it's associated.







Allocate before calling.



Copyright © 2010, Elsevier Inc. All rights Reserved











- So args_p can point to a list containing one or more values needed by thread_function.
- Similarly, the return value of thread_function can point to a list of one or more values.







Main thread forks and joins two threads



Stopping the Threads

- We call the function pthread_join once for each thread.
- A single call to pthread_join will wait for the thread associated with the pthread_t object to complete.







Source: https://computing.llnl.gov/tutorials/pthreads/

COMP/CS 605: Lecture Presented: 04/04/17 Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

Matrix-Vector Multiplication with Pthreads

Matrix-Vector Multiplication with Pthreads

Updated: 04/03/17

Definition: Let A be an $[m \times n]$ matrix, and x be a be an $[n \times 1]$, then y will be a vector with the dimensions $[m \times 1]$.

Then
$$y_j = \sum_{t=1}^m a_{it} x_t = a_{i1} x_1 + a_{i2} x_2 + \dots + a_{m-1,1} b_{m-1}$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} a_{00} \dots a_{0j} \dots a_{0,n-1} \\ \dots \\ a_{i0} \dots a_{ij} \dots a_{i,n-1} \\ \dots \\ \dots \\ a_{m-1,0} \dots a_{m-1,j} \dots a_{m-1,n-1} \end{bmatrix} \bullet \begin{bmatrix} x_0 \\ \dots \\ x_i \\ x_n \\ x_n \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} y_0 \\ \dots \\ y_j \\ \dots \\ y_{m-1} \end{bmatrix}$$

<i>a</i> ₀₀	<i>a</i> 01	 $a_{0,n-1}$		уо
a10	a11	 $a_{1,n-1}$	<i>x</i> 0	<i>y</i> 1
:	:	:	<i>x</i> ₁	:
aio	a _{i1}	 $a_{i,n-1}$: -	$y_i = a_{i0}x_0 + a_{i1}x_1 + \dots + a_{i,n-1}x_{n-1}$
:	:	:	x_{n-1}	:
$a_{m-1,0}$	$a_{m-1,1}$	 $a_{m-1,n-1}$		<i>Ут</i> -1

23/40 Mary Thomas

1



$$y_i = \sum_{j=0}^{n-1} a_{ij} x_j$$

COMP/CS 605: Lecture Presented: 04/04/17 Up

Updated: 04/03/17

25/40 M

Mary Thomas

Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

Matrix-Vector Multiplication with Pthreads

Using 3 Pthreads, 6 elements



COMP/CS 605:	Lecture	Presented: 04/04/17	Updated: 04/03/17	26/40	Mary Thomas
Shared Memor	y Programming	with PThreads			
Matrix-Vect	or Multiplication	with Pthreads			

```
/* File:
 *
      pth_mat_vect.c
 * *
* Compile: gcc -g -Wall -o pth_mat_vect pth_mat_vect.c -lpthread
* Usage:
      pth mat vect <thread count>
*
* IPP:
          Section 4.3 (pp. 159 and ff.). Also Section 4.10 (pp. 191)
*/
#include <stdio h>
#include <stdlib.h>
#include <pthread.h>
/* Global variables */
       thread_count;
int
       m. n:
int
double* A:
double* x:
double* y;
/* Serial functions */
void Usage(char* prog name);
void Read matrix(char* prompt, double A[], int m, int n);
void Read_vector(char* prompt, double x[], int n);
void Print_matrix(char* title, double A[], int m, int n);
void Print_vector(char* title, double y[], double m);
/* Parallel function */
void *Pth_mat_vect(void* rank);
```

COMP/CS 605:	Lecture	Presented: 04/04/17	Updated: 04/03/17	27/40	Mary Thomas
Shared Memory	Programming	with PThreads			
Matrix-Vecto	or Multiplication	with Pthreads			

```
int main(int argc, char* argv[]) {
   long
             thread:
  pthread t* thread handles:
  if (argc != 2) Usage(argv[0]):
  thread count = atoi(argv[1]);
  thread_handles = malloc(thread_count*sizeof(pthread_t));
  printf("Enter m and n\n");
                               scanf("%d%d", &m, &n);
   A = malloc(m*n*sizeof(double)):
  x = malloc(n*sizeof(double));
  y = malloc(m*sizeof(double));
  Read_matrix("Enter the matrix", A, m, n); Print_matrix("We read", A, m, n);
  Read_vector("Enter the vector", x, n); Print_vector("We read", x, n);
  for (thread = 0; thread < thread_count; thread++)</pre>
     pthread_create(&thread_handles[thread], NULL,
                                                     Pth_mat_vect, (void*) thread);
  for (thread = 0; thread < thread_count; thread++)</pre>
     pthread_join(thread_handles[thread], NULL);
  Print_vector("The product is", y, m);
  free(A); free(x);
                        free(y);
  return 0;
```

Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

Matrix-Vector Multiplication with Pthreads

```
/*-----
* Function: Usage
* Purpose: print a message showing what the command line should
*
      be, and terminate
* In arg : prog_name
*/
void Usage (char* prog name) {
 fprintf(stderr, "usage: %s <thread_count>\n", prog_name);
  exit(0):
} /* Usage */
/*-----
* Function: Read_matrix
* Purpose: Read in the matrix
* In args: prompt, m, n
* Out arg: A
*/
void Read_matrix(char* prompt, double A[], int m, int n) {
             i, j;
  int
  printf("%s\n", prompt);
 for (i = 0: i < m: i++)
    for (j = 0; j < n; j++)
      scanf("%lf", &A[i*n+i]);
} /* Read matrix */
/*-----
* Function: Read_vector
* Purpose: Read in the vector x
            prompt, n
* In arg:
         x
* Out arg:
*/
void Read_vector(char* prompt, double x[], int n) {
  int i;
  printf("%s\n", prompt);
  for (i = 0; i < n; i++)
```

Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

Matrix-Vector Multiplication with Pthreads

```
/*-----
             Pth_mat_vect
Multiply an mxn matrix by an nx1 column vector
* Function:
* Purpose:
* In arg: rank
* Global in vars: A, x, m, n, thread_count
* Global out var: y
*/
void *Pth mat vect(void* rank) {
  long my_rank = (long) rank;
  int i, j;
  int local m = m/thread count:
  int my_first_row = my_rank*local_m;
  int my last row = (my rank+1)*local m - 1:
  for (i = mv first row: i <= mv last row: i++) {
     v[i] = 0.0;
     for (j = 0; j < n; j++)
        v[i] += A[i*n+i]*x[i]:
  }
  return NULL:
} /* Pth mat vect */
/*-----
* Function: Print_matrix
* Purpose: Print the matrix
* In args: title, A, m, n
*/
void Print_matrix( char* title, double A[], int m, int n) {
  int i, j;
  printf("%s\n", title);
  for (i = 0; i < m; i++) {
     for (j = 0; j < n; j++)
       printf("%4.1f ", A[i*n + j]);
     printf("\n");
  3
```

COMP/CS 605: Lecture

Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17

30/40

Mary Thomas

Shared Memory Programming with PThreads

Matrix-Vector Multiplication with Pthreads

Compiling and Running Pth_Mat_Vec on tuckoo

```
[mthomas@tuckoo pacheco/ch4] mthomas% gcc -g -Wall -o pth_mat_vect pth_mat_vect.c -lpthread
[mthomas@tuckoo pacheco/ch4] mthomas% ./pth_mat_vect 4
Enter m and n
44
Enter the matrix
1234
5678
9 10 11 12
1234
We read
1.0 2.0 3.0 4.0
5.0 6.0 7.0 8.0
9.0 10.0 11.0 12.0
1.0 2.0 3.0 4.0
Enter the vector
9763
We read
9.0 7.0 6.0 3.0
The product is
53.0 153.0 253.0 53.0
```



- More Straightforward because of shared memory
- Code only *reads* shared arrays (A, x), so no contention associated with shared updates of same memory location
- No thread communication
- Small jobs, small memory

Next we'll look at what happens when multiple threads need to update same memory location

COMP/CS 605: Lecture	Presented: 04/04/17	Updated: 04/03/17	32/40	Mary Thomas
Pthreads: Controlling Access	and Synchronization			
Critical Sections				
Critical S	Sections			

- Matrix-vector multiplication was straightforward to code:
 - Shared-memory locations were accessed in a simple manner.
 - After initialization, all of the variables but y are read only.
 - After initialization, shared variables not changed.
- Threads make changes to y: but elements are owned by a thread.
- There are *no* attempts by multiple threads to modify the *same* element.
- What happens if this is not the case? What happens when multiple threads update a single memory location?

COMP/CS 605: Lecture

Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17

33/40 Mary Thomas

Pthreads: Controlling Access and Synchronization

Critical Sections

Estimating π using n terms of A Maclaurin series: Serial Code

$$\pi = 4\left(1 - \frac{1}{3} + \frac{1}{5} - \frac{1}{7} + \dots + (-1)^n \frac{1}{2n+1} + \dotsb\right)$$

```
double factor = 1.0:
double sum = 0.0:
for (i = 0; i < n; i++, factor = -factor) {
   sum += factor/(2*i+1);
pi = 4.0 * sum;
```

See: https://www.math.hmc.edu/funfacts/ffiles/30001.1-3.shtml

Pthreads: Controlling Access and Synchronization

COMP/CS 605: Lecture Pthreads: Controlling A Critical Sections

POSIX Threads: Pacheco pthd_pi.c

First attempt:

- Parallelize similar to the way we did matrix-vector multiplication:
- Divide iterates in the for loop and make sum a shared variable.

```
* Function:
                   Thread_sum,
                                Purpose: Add in the terms computed by the thread running this
 * In arg:
                   rank
 * Ret val:
                  ignored
 * Globals in: n, thread_count
 * Global in/out: sum
 */
void* Thread_sum(void* rank) {
   long my_rank = (long) rank;
  double factor;
   long long i, my_n = n/thread_count, my_first_i = my_n*my_rank, my_last_i = my_first_i + my_n;
   if (my first i % 2 == 0)
     factor = 1.0:
   else
     factor = -1.0:
   for (i = my_first_i; i < my_last_i; i++, factor = -factor)
     sum += factor/(2*i+1);
   return NULL:
} /* Thread sum */
```

Presented: 04/04/17

Updated: 04/03/17

35/40

Mary Thomas

Pthreads: Controlling Access and Synchronization

COMP/CS 605: Lecture Critical Sections

Program run with 2 threads, dual core processor

		п					
	105	10^{6}	107	10^{8}			
π	3.14159	3.141593	3.1415927	3.14159265			
1 Thread	3.14158	3.141592	3.1415926	3.14159264			
2 Threads	3.14158	3.141480	3.1413692	3.14164686			

- For two threads, as $n \uparrow$ accuracy of $\pi \uparrow$
- But, as # threads \uparrow accuracy of $\pi \downarrow$

Updated: 04/03/17

36/40 Mary Thomas

Pthreads: Controlling Access and Synchronization

Critical Sections

This Leads to Possible Race Condition

Time	Thread 0	Thread 1
1	Started by main thread	
2	Call Compute ()	Started by main thread
3	Assign $y = 1$	Call Compute ()
4	Put x=0 and y=1 into registers	Assign $y = 2$
5	Add 0 and 1	Put x=0 and y=2 into registers
6	Store 1 in memory location x	Add 0 and 2
7		Store 2 in memory location x

Fundamental problem with Pthreads: when multiple threads try to access/update the same resource, the result can be unpredictable.

COMP/CS 605: Lecture

Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17

37/40

Mary Thomas

Pthreads: Controlling Access and Synchronization

Critical Sections

POSIX Threads: Pacheco pthd_pi.c (1)

```
/* File:
            pth_pi.c
 * Purpose: Try to estimate pi using the formula:
            pi = 4*[1 - 1/3 + 1/5 - 1/7 + 1/9 - ...]
  *
 *
 * Compile: gcc -g -Wall -o pth_pi pth_pi.c -lm -lpthread
           ./pth_pi <number of threads> <n>
 * Run:
 *
             n is the number of terms of the series to use.
             n should be evenly divisible by the number of threads
 * Input:
            none
 * Output:
            Estimate of pi as computed by multiple threads, estimate
 *
             as computed by one thread, and 4*arctan(1).
 * Notes:
      1. The radius of convergence for the series is only 1. So the series converges quite slowly.
      2. This version will not get right answer bcs all threads are trying to update sum !!!!!
 *
 *
    Function needs a critical section to control update.
 * IPP:
          Section 4.4 (pp. 162 and ff.)
 */
#include <stdio.h>
#include <stdlib.h>
#include <math.h>
#include <pthread.h>
const int MAX_THREADS = 1024;
long thread_count;
long long n;
double sum:
void* Thread sum(void* rank):
/* Only executed by main thread */
void Get_args(int argc, char* argv[]);
void Usage(char* prog_name);
double Serial_pi(long long n);
```

COMP/CS 605: Lecture

Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17

38/40

Mary Thomas

Pthreads: Controlling Access and Synchronization

Critical Sections

POSIX Threads: Pacheco *pthd_pi.c* (2)

```
int main(int argc, char* argv[]) {
              thread: /* Use long in case of a 64-bit system */
   long
   pthread t* thread handles:
   double
              sersum:
   double piref=3.14159265358979323846264:
   /* Get number of threads from command line */
  Get_args(argc, argv);
   thread handles = (pthread t*) malloc (thread count*sizeof(pthread t));
   sum = 0.0;
   for (thread = 0: thread < thread count: thread++)
      pthread create(&thread handles[thread], NULL,
          Thread sum. (void*)thread):
   for (thread = 0: thread < thread count: thread++)
      pthread_join(thread_handles[thread], NULL);
   sum = 4.0 * sum;
   printf("With n = %lld terms, \n", n);
   printf(" Reference value for pi = %.15f\n", piref);
   printf(" Pthread estimate of pi = %.15f\n", sum);
   printf(" Pthread error for pi = %.15f\n", fabs(piref - sum) );
   sersum = Serial_pi(n);
                Single thread est = \%.15f n'', sersum);
   printf("
   printf(" Single Thd err for pi = %.15f\n", fabs(piref - sersum) );
   free(thread_handles);
   return 0:
   free(thread_handles);
   return 0;
} /* main */
```

39/40 Mary Thomas

Pthreads: Controlling Access and Synchronization

Critical Sections

POSIX Threads: Pacheco *pthd_pi.c* (3)

```
*-----
* Function:
                Thread sum. Purpose: Add in the terms computed by the thread running this
                rank
* In arg:
* Ret val:
              ignored
* Globals in: n, thread_count
* Global in/out: sum
*/
void* Thread sum(void* rank) {
  long my_rank = (long) rank;
  double factor;
  long long i, my_n = n/thread_count, my_first_i = my_n*my_rank, my_last_i = my_first_i + my_n;
  if (my_first_i % 2 == 0)
     factor = 1.0;
  else
     factor = -1.0;
  for (i = my_first_i; i < my_last_i; i++, factor = -factor)
     sum += factor/(2*i+1);
  return NULL;
} /* Thread_sum */
/*-----
 * Function: Serial_pi, Purpose: Estimate pi using 1 thread
 * In arg:
            n
* Return val: Estimate of pi using n terms of Maclaurin series
*/
double Serial_pi(long long n) {
  double sum = 0.0. factor = 1.0:
  long long i;
  for (i = 0; i < n; i++, factor = -factor)
             sum += factor/(2*i+1):
  return 4.0*sum:
} /* Serial_pi */
```

P/CS 605: Lecture Presented: 04/04/17 Updated: 04/03/17	40/40 Mary
eads: Controlling Access and Synchronization	
itical Sections	
[mtnomas@tuckoo cn4]\$./ptn_p1 100 1000	
Lwith n = 1000 terms,	
Reference value for pi = 3.14159265383/93	
Pthread estimate of p1 = 3.140592653839794	
Pthread error for p1 = 0.000999999749999	
Single thread est = 3.140592653839794	
Single ind err ior pi = 0.000999999/49999	
[mthomas@tuckoo ch4]\$./pth pi 100 10000	
With n = 10000 terms.	
Reference value for pi = 3.141592653589793	
Pthread estimate of pi = 3.141492653590034	
Pthread error for pi = 0.000099999999759	
Single thread est = 3,141492653590034	
Single Thd err for pi = 0.000099999999759	
- · · ·	
[mthomas@tuckoo ch4]\$./pth_pi 100 100000	
With n = 100000 terms,	
Reference value for pi = 3.141592653589793	
Pthread estimate of pi = 3.142916601214706	
Pthread error for pi = 0.001323947624913>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>	error increasing
Single thread est = 3.141582653589720	
Single Thd err for pi = 0.00001000000073	
[mthomas@tuckoo ch4]\$./pth pi 100 1000000	
With n = 1000000 terms,	
Reference value for pi = 3.141592653589793	
Pthread estimate of pi = 3.004711135456170	
Pthread error for pi = 0.136881518133623	
Single thread est = 3.141591653589774	
Single Thd err for pi = 0.000001000000019	
mthomas@tuckoo ch4]\$./pth_pi 100 10000000	
With n = 10000000 terms,	
Reference value for pi = 3.141592653589793	
Pthread estimate of pi = -0.028399192093270	
Pthread error for pi = 3.169991845683063	
Single thread est = 3.141592553589792	

Single Thd err for pi = 0.000000100000002